

MINUTES  
MURFREESBORO CITY SCHOOL BOARD  
Tuesday, October 27, 2009  
6:30 p.m.—Central Administration Building

ATTENDANCE

Board: Chair Mary Wade, Susan Andrews, Ray Butrum, Butch Campbell, Nancy Duggin, David Hopper, Nancy Phillips, and Council Liaison Ron Washington.

Staff: Interim Director Dr. Carolyn B. Tucker, Gary Anderson, Crystal Farris, Cheryl Harris, Michelle Hummel, Danielle Kaminsky, and Priscilla Van Tries.

Others: City Staff Attorney Kelley Baker, *Daily News Journal* Reporter Chasity Gunn, principals, and others.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

I. CALL TO ORDER BY BOARD CHAIR

Chair Mary Wade called the Murfreesboro City School Board meeting to order at approximately 6:30 p.m. Mrs. Cheryl Harris led the Board and audience in the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

*RECOGNITION OF NEWLY APPOINTED INTERIM DIRECTOR OF SCHOOLS:  
DR. CAROLYN BALDWIN TUCKER -- Chair Wade*

Chair Wade introduced newly-appointed Interim Director of Schools Dr. Carolyn Baldwin Tucker sharing Dr. Tucker's professional background in education as a teacher, principal, Director of Elementary Schools, administrator, Exemplary Educator for the State Dept. of Education, is a visiting Professor at David Lipscomb University, as well as the many awards she received. Dr. Tucker also served on the Metro-Nashville Davidson Council for two terms.

Dr. Tucker thanked the Board for the opportunity to work with them in serving the children of this community.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mrs. Wade asked that the agenda be rearranged so that consent and action items could be covered at the beginning of the meeting. Mr. Hopper moved to rearrange the agenda placing consent and action items before the communications section; Mr. Campbell seconded the motion.

### III. COMMUNICATIONS

- November 15-21 is American Education Week. Theme—*Great Public Schools: A Basic Right and Our Responsibility*
- The Murfreesboro City Schools Foundation “Fashion Show,” will be held on Saturday, October 31, 11:00 a.m., at the Stones River Country Club.
- Congratulations to Principal Catherine Stephens who has received two awards. She has been named Coordinated School Health “Principal of the Year” for the State of Tennessee, and “Administrator of the Year” for the Tennessee Association for Health, Physical Education, Recreation and Dance.
- Congratulations to Ms. Andrea Cain, Coordinator of School Health, who has been named “Health Professional of the Year” for the Tennessee Association for Health, Physical Education, Recreation and Dance.
- Congratulations to Chair Mary Wade who will receive her Boardmanship Level V status at the TSBA Conference banquet on November 16. Mrs. Duggin added that according to TSBA’s records at hand, it is believed that Mrs. Wade is the first MCS Board member to achieve Level V status that involves a portfolio and attendance at various meetings and functions.
- Congratulations to Board member Ray Butrum who has been nominated as a finalist in the Ruthies category of “Favorite Elected Official.”  
Congratulations to Cason Lane Principal Chad Fletcher and Scales Principal Catherine Stephens who were finalists in the “Favorite School Principal” category and to Scales Elementary teacher Julia Barrett as a finalist in the “Favorite School Teacher” category. Dr. Butrum added that Board member Butch Campbell had been named “Principal of the Year” in that Ruthies category.
- Congratulations to Board Member Nancy Phillips and City Cable 3’s Steve Burris for their Honorable Mention Award by the National Association of Telecommunications Officers and Advisors at the 24<sup>th</sup> Annual Government Programming Awards for the “Murphy’s Burrow” program. City Cable 3 also received second and third place for the “We Know Education in Rutherford County” video produced by John Padgett and Terri Sterling.
- Congratulations to the Bellwood-Bowdoin Preschool for recognition by the U.S. Commerce Association as the “2009 Best of Murfreesboro Award.”
- Discovery School sixth-grade teacher Kristy Mall is proud to announce that 37 students were selected for publication in the Creative Communications summer poetry contest, earning the school the Poetic Achievement Award.
- Congratulations to Scales fourth-grade teacher Kristina Maddux for her recognition as a Titans Teacher of the Week. Ms. Maddux will receive \$400 in supplies and be recognized on the Titans’ radio show.

- Principal Robin Newell thanks the following businesses for their support of MNP's fall festival: Dr. Stephen Simpson, Lewis Bakeries, Clark's Body Shop, and WGNS 1450. And, thanks to Smyrna Bowling Alley and the Northfield Kroger for their annual monetary support, and Third Baptist Church for the wonderful luncheon provided for teachers.
- Thanks to the Joy of Living Lutheran Church for the donation from several congregations of underclothing for students and to Bill Shaw Construction for donating school supplies for all children through the system's Community Outreach Program.
- Thanks to the Advent Lutheran Church for their \$110 donation to the Family Resource Center.
- Congratulations to Bradley band teacher Mr. Luke Hill who has received another \$5,000 grant from the Bruning Foundation. Mr. Hill hopes to add a drum line to his music program.
- Congratulations to MNP kindergarten teacher Ms. Donna Hill who recently had a "Morning Meeting" idea published in *The Mailbox Magazine*.
- Thanks to Ricky Skaggs and Skaggs Family Records for their \$200 donation to The Discovery School. The Discovery School fifth grade performed "Spread a Little Love Around" at a recent Barnes & Noble event.
- Congratulations to CLA school counselor Laura Perkins who received a Community Service Award for her service to children, especially those whose parents have been deployed during Operation Enduring Freedom.
- Thanks to Mr. Ron Moody and the ExxonMobil Educational Alliance program for their donation of \$750 to Scales Elementary.

#### IV. CONSENT ITEMS (Tab 1)

On motion by Mr. Hopper and second by Dr. Andrews, the following consent agenda items were approved by acclamation:

- A. Minutes of the Special Called Board Meeting of October 13, 2009
- B. The Textbook Adoption Committee
- C. "Report of System/School Compliance Based on Tennessee State Statutes and State Board of Education Rules, Regulations, and Minimum Standards for Approval of Schools"

V. ACTION ITEMS

A. Election of School Board Chair and Vice Chair

Mrs. Baker explained to the Board that according to Board Policy BO 13 and TCA 49-2-202 and section 25-6 of the Murfreesboro City Code, Board officers are to be elected annually. The state statute mandates that the Board only elect a chair; however, BO 3 mandates that the Board elect both a Chair and Vice Chair with the term being November 1, 2009 to Oct 31, 2010. Nominations for board chair will be given followed by a roll call vote, and then nominations will be taken for board vice chair with roll call vote. A majority of four votes is necessary for one to be voted into office. Board officers cannot be elected by acclamation.

Mrs. Baker called for nominations for Board Chair:

Mrs. Phillips nominated Mrs. Mary Wade for Board Chair; there were no other nominations. On roll call: Andrews—Wade; Butrum—Wade; Campbell—Wade; Duggin—Wade; Hopper—Wade; Phillips—Wade; Wade—Wade. The motion carried unanimously.

Mrs. Baker called for nominations for Vice Chair: Dr. Andrews nominated Mrs. Nancy Phillips. Dr. Butrum nominated Mrs. Nancy Duggin.

On roll call for Mrs. Nancy Phillips: Andrews—yes; Butrum—no; Campbell—no; Duggin—no; Hopper—yes; Phillips—yes; Wade—yes.

On roll call for Mrs. Nancy Duggin: Andrews—No; Butrum—yes; Campbell—yes; Duggin—yes; Hopper—no; Phillips—no; Wade—no.

Mrs. Nancy Phillips was elected as Board Vice Chair by majority vote.

Mrs. Duggin asked if the Board would agree to move the election of board officers to September in coming years so that that individual would have the opportunity to attend the “New Board Chair” training offered by TSBA which occurs once a year in October. Dr. Butrum seconded the motion. The election as it stands occurs after this training takes place. After discussion, Mrs. Duggin restated her motion that the Board change the time of the election of Board Chair and Vice Chair to September, instead of the current October, allowing the Chair and Vice Chair to attend the state training, and then they would begin the performance of their duties at the November board meeting. Dr. Butrum as second agreed.

On roll call: Butrum—yes--; Campbell—yes; Duggin—yes; Hopper—yes; Phillips—yes; Andrews—yes; Wade—yes. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Determination of Compensation Guidelines for Position of Director of Schools

Mrs. Baker explained that Dr. Jones had indicated to her that what he needs is guidelines, not specific figures, but a salary range which the Board would endeavor to stay within based on the candidate's experience and qualifications. He did not want the Board to box themselves into a specific number. Things to consider would be does the board want the range to stay within the top quartile or the mid range of the top quartile within the state. Dr. Jones stated that you could compare the salary of the MCS director of schools to other directors' salaries in other city or special school systems in Tennessee. She stated that he said district size is not necessarily relevant when making comparisons. In his experience, the salary is based more on the needs of the district and the qualifications of the director, such as the director's degrees, length of experience, and background. He provided information to the Board of a study done in the past that provided a range to the Board.

Mr. Hopper shared that several years ago a consultant was hired to help the Board establish a salary administration plan. A salary administration plan is in place with salary ranges, and the salary of the director/administration can then be determined based on qualifications, experience, etc. A copy of the ranges was distributed to the Board. Mrs. Baker stated that Dr. Jones has a copy of the ranges. She explained that the document with ranges was adopted by the Board at the time the consultant was employed. Mr. Anderson added that the document has been in the Board's budget notebook since its adoption in October 2004 and has been increased based on what the Board has approved. Dr. Butrum asked if the range could be redone. Mrs. Baker stated that what Dr. Jones wants from the Board is to tell him if this is the range we are looking for, or what other criteria you wish to use in regard to the range if you are considering the same benefits package that was provided to Mrs. Mathis, or are there additional items the Board would like to add based on the candidate.

Dr. Butrum asked that the car allowance be revisited to maybe offer a system car or mileage reimbursement. Mr. Hopper commented that the range offers Dr. Jones and Mrs. Wade the opportunity to negotiate at the appropriate point based on the qualifications of the candidate. Until discussions begin with the candidate, the Board can only offer a range with which the Board is comfortable. He noted that the car allowance provided to Mrs. Mathis was equivalent at the time to what the city administration received, and that purchasing a system car would be more expensive. Dr. Andrews stated that perhaps the motion should clarify that the range is a guideline to allow flexibility. In response to Mrs. Duggin's question, Mr. Washington explained that the Council receives an

## Board Meeting Minutes

Page 6

October 27, 2009

allowance, but they have gotten away from that with other employees who now receive mileage reimbursement. Mrs. Duggin stated that a flat rate or mileage would be more advantageous than purchasing a system car. She added that the benefits package should not exceed the current package. Dr. Butrum stated that they should not look at quartile/top percentage, but should tie this to performance and would like to see the range dropped to a maximum of \$100,000-\$105,000 for salary. The current range is \$139,000. He stated that the system does not warrant a high cost director, comparing the K-6 system to a K-12 system. Mrs. Phillips asked if a moving allowance would be an item for negotiation if needed. Also, she stated that you get what you pay for, and it has been the Board's goal to keep teachers in the top 10%, or at least top 25%. She believes the teachers and students warrant the best director possible so the Board should allow flexibility to Dr. Jones, Mrs. Wade, and Mrs. Baker to negotiate with the candidate rather than boxing things in.

Mr. Washington stated that the Board needed to have flexibility to get the best person possible identifying the Board's expectations and requiring accountability through performance, but work toward getting the best candidate possible. Mr. Campbell referenced a range of \$85,000-\$105,000, that the Board not pay civic club dues, and that mileage reimbursement be the method of handling the director's travel expenses. He suggested that conference and other director-related expenses be reported to the Board on a monthly basis. Dr. Andrews pointed out that based on the current administrators' pay ranges, Dr. Butrum's suggested range would put the director in the lower range of what was recommended for the associate director's position. This would put the director's pay below what the Board has been trying to accomplish over the past several years to maintain the system's lighthouse status. She is not willing to lower the salary, but wants to make sure the salary will attract the best person for the job. This person would be the CEO of a large organization employing approximately 1,000 individuals that is similar to the number of city employees. Dr. Butrum stated that he knew if they lowered the director's range, they would have to lower other ranges, but the system does not have an assistant director. He noted that in terms of the overall responsibilities of the director, \$100,000 to \$105,000 is appropriate, and if a person doesn't apply based on the proposed salary that's okay. He does not believe paying more will get the system more.

Mrs. Phillips moved that the Board use the compensation range that is already in the document as a guideline for negotiations with the candidate (\$102,961 to \$139,250). Dr. Andrews seconded the motion. Dr. Butrum pointed out that with the lowest being \$103,000, a candidate would think that \$103,000 would be the lowest they would expect to be offered. Mr. Campbell noted that if you add other compensation packages, the amount would be up to \$108,000, plus benefits, which he felt would be high, compared to nearby systems. Dr. Andrews stated that other systems receive benefits packages, and

that there are other nearby systems within this range, which is the range people are getting paid. Mrs. Duggin recommended that the low end of the range be lowered to \$90,000 to give the system room to grow and to give raises. Mr. Hopper stated that our system does not have an assistant director where most other systems have assistant director(s). When hiring, the Board will ask what degrees they have, experience, etc. The Board needs to be prepared to pay an amount that will get the right person for the job. The system already has people with salaries in the \$90,000 range, and he did not think a candidate would be attracted to the director's position with his/her employees making more than the director. He stressed that this is a difficult job, and the system needs the best person available to be making decisions representing the system/Board. The Board needs to hire someone with experience. He did think the car allowance could be reviewed. Mrs. Wade stated that when she and Mrs. Baker sit down to negotiate with the candidate, experience and other qualifications would be taken into consideration. This is a range and guideline for Dr. Jones.

On roll call: Andrews—yes; Butrum—no; Campbell—no; Duggin—no; Hopper—yes; Phillips—yes; Wade—yes. The motion carried.

## VI. REPORTS/INFORMATION

Dr. Tucker shared the following personnel information:

### A. Personnel Update (Tab 2)

#### 1. Completion of Ninety Days:

Isabel Garcia	E.A.	CLA
Tracy Giles	School Secretary	Discovery
Kimberly Hasselbrink	E.A.	CLA
Mark Martin	Special Ed E.A.	Scales
Andrea Rumley	Special Ed E.A.	Scales

#### 2. Interim Teachers Hired for 2009-10

#### 3. New Teachers Hired for 2009-10

### B. Monthly Revenue and Expenditure Report (Tab 3)

Mr. Anderson shared that net income is a negative \$4,451,120. He is monitoring the revenue side, sales tax collections, etc. July's sales tax revenue was behind 10% compared to 8% in August that could indicate a trend. The system had dropped their revenue expectations so basically revenue is on track, but he is watching the trend.

The system has completed 25% of the fiscal year with expenditures at 23.2% so the system is on target. Capital outlay reflects the reroofing at Black Fox. Attendance expenditures increased by 53% due to the system paying \$17,500 to Century Consultants to support STAR Student. The state shifted this expense to school systems. In response to Mr. Hopper's question regarding additional shifting of expenses to school systems, Mr. Anderson responded that he did not anticipate more this year as the state has used some federal stimulus money to cover some of the expenses although there is still some talk about the systems picking up the internet charge.

C. Attendance Report (Tab 4)

Dr. Tucker reported that total student enrollment for the second reporting period is 6,931 students (compared to this month last year's enrollment of 6,907). The first month's enrollment was 6,914, so growth has occurred with an additional enrollment of 17 students in the second reporting period. The report indicates a 95% attendance rate. The overall pupil:teacher ratio is approximately 19:1. The system also serves 382 regular ed preschool students.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

Mrs. Duggin requested that a letter be written on behalf of the Board to be sent to all employees commending them for the great job they do in honor of American Education Week.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Wade adjourned the regular Murfreesboro City School Board meeting at approximately 7: 45 p.m.

---

Interim Director of Schools

**MISSION STATEMENT**  
*To assure academic and personal success  
for each child.*